

# THE PROTECTION OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

*Henning Grosse Ruse - Khan*

## OUTLINE

### PART ONE: INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1: Linkages in International Law affecting Intellectual Property (IP)

Chapter 2: The Systemic Character of International Law

I. The ILC Approach

II. Is International Law a (Legal) System?

III. Societal Differentiation and Systems-Theory

IV. A Functional Approach

Chapter 3: Approaches for Analysing Norm Relationships

I. 'Conflict of Norms' Principles

The principle of harmonious interpretation and systemic integration

Defining norm conflicts

Conflict norms in general international law

*Lex Posterior Derogat Legi Priori*

*Lex Specialis Derogat Legi Generali*

II. Conflict-of-Laws Principles

Inter-systemic Conflicts

Qualifikation, dépeçage and governmental interest analysis

Comity and a conflict-rule of integration

Ordre public and mandatory rules as safeguards

Pleading and Proving Foreign Law

III. Substantive Law Integration

IV. The Toolbox

### PART TWO: NORM RELATIONS *WITHIN* THE INTERNATIONAL IP SYSTEM

Chapter 1: Norm Relations amongst Multilateral Treaties

I. Revisions of- and Special Agreements to the Berne- and Paris Conventions

Subsequent Acts of the Paris- and Berne Conventions

Reciprocal or Integral Obligations?

Special Agreements under Art.20 BC, Art.19 PC

*'Special' agreements*

*Requirements in the specific conflict rules*

*Consequences of inconsistency*

II. WTO/TRIPS Relations with the Main Pre-Existing IP Treaties

The 'Convention-Plus' approach

The 'Non-Derogation' approach

*Optional TRIPS provisions vs. binding Convention obligations*

*Binding TRIPS obligations vs. optional Convention rules*

*Harmonious interpretation: continuity vs. adaptation*

Chapter 2: The Relationship between TRIPS and Later Inter-Se Agreements

I. FTA IP Obligations and TRIPS flexibilities

Relationships of interpretation

Relationships of conflict

II. Conflict Resolution Norms in TRIPS and under General International Law

Article 1 (1) of the TRIPS Agreement

*The conflict rule character of the no-contravention rule in TRIPS*

*Additional IP protection may not 'contravene' TRIPS provisions*

Article 41 VCLT

*Affecting rights or obligations of other WTO Members*

*Undermining the effective operation of TRIPS' object and purpose: the nature of TRIPS obligations*

Lex Posterior and Lex Specialis

III. Conflict Clauses in FTAs

Affirming WTO/TRIPS (rights and) obligations

References to the Doha Declaration

References to (specific) TRIPS flexibilities

IV. Conflict Resolution via Harmonious Interpretation and Priority in

Application: The Limits of FTAs Shaping TRIPS Interpretation

Chapter 3: The Legal Relationships within the International IP System: From Continuity to Resilience

## PART THREE: ALTERNATIVE RULE SYSTEMS FOR THE PROTECTION OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

Chapter 1: Intellectual Property under International Investment Agreements

I. The Scope for IP Protection under IIAs

IP-related definitions of investment in IIAs

The host state's IP law as determining factor

Applications for IP rights

Additional criteria for IP rights as protected investments

IP rights as protected investments in the tobacco packaging disputes

II. Non-Discrimination Standards in IIAs

National treatment and MFN in international IP Law

National treatment and MFN in IIAs

The relevance of reciprocity rules in international IP Law

III. Absolute Standards of Treatment for Foreign Investments

Fair and equitable treatment

*Legitimate investor expectations vs. the right to regulate*

*IP rights as basis for investor expectations?*  
*International IP norms as a legitimate source of expectations?*  
IP enforcement and ‘full protection and security’  
Expropriation and IP rights  
*Indirect expropriation and measures limiting IP rights*  
*Safeguard clauses for international IP flexibilities*  
*Conditions for expropriating IP rights as foreign investments*

IV. International IP Obligations in Investor State Arbitration

Most-favoured-nation clauses  
Fair and equitable treatment and umbrella clauses  
Clauses requiring consistency with international IP rules

Chapter 2: The Protection of Intellectual Property in International Human Rights Law

I. The Scope for Protection for Creator’s Rights under Art.27 UDHR and Art.15 (1) c) ICESCR

Creator’s rights: Drafting history and context  
General Comment No.17

*Status and Function*  
*Substance: Delineating Scope and Content of Creator’s Rights*  
*Conceptual Differences to the International IP System*

II. The Right to (Intellectual) Property

IP rights in front of the European Court of Human Rights  
*Possessions as protected subject matter*

The role of national law  
Deference to national courts?  
Applications for IP rights

*State interference vis-à-vis IP rights*  
*Reviewing justifications for an interference*

Balancing the right to (intellectual) property with other human rights  
*Copyright enforcement vs. freedom of expression under the ECHR*

*Art.17 (2) of the EU Charter*

III. Overlaps and Conflict Norms in the Human Rights System

The CJEU, international IP rules and Art.17 (2) of the EU Charter  
The right to property, other ECHR rights and external rules  
The CESCR, other UN human rights organs and TRIPS

Chapter 3: Investment and human rights perspectives: increasing cross-fertilization with the international IP System

PART FOUR: INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND OTHER RULE SYSTEMS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

Chapter 1: The Perspective of World Trade Law on IP Rights

I. IP Protection and Enforcement – a Barrier to or Facilitator of International Trade?

- II. IP Rights under GATT – the Pre-TRIPS Cases
  - US – Automotive Spring Assemblies*
  - US – Section 337 of the Trade Act (1930)*
- III. TRIPS-plus protection and enforcement as barrier to trade
  - EU – Seizures of Generic Drugs in Transit*
  - Extending trademark rights to goods in transit
  - Freedom of transit under Art.V GATT
  - TRIPS-plus protection of geographical indications
  - GATT non-discrimination standards and quantitative restrictions
- IV. Art.XX d) GATT as Conflict Norm in the Trade – IP Relationship
  - Justifying transit seizures and IP rights covering transit
    - GATT consistency test*
    - Necessity test and chapeau*
  - Justifying TRIPS-plus GI protection
- V. Safeguarding a common core of IP protection – the role of TRIPS

## Chapter 2: IP Rights in International Environmental Law

- I. The foundation for biological resource and technology transfer rules in international law
  - The New International Economic Order movement
  - Merging technology transfer demands with concerns over protecting the environment
  - Sovereignty over biological resources in exchange for access and conservation
  - The fate of IP demands and the neglect of Traditional Knowledge
- II. Access and Benefit-Sharing regarding GRs and associated TK
  - IP-related issues facing provider and user countries
  - Access and benefit-sharing obligations in the CBD and the NP
    - Article 15 and 8 j) CBD*
    - The Bonn Guidelines*
    - The Nagoya Protocol on Access and Benefit-Sharing*
      - Access to GRs and associated TK
      - Benefit-sharing
      - Compliance
- III. Transfer of technology resulting from the utilization of GRs and associated TK
  - The scope and limits of obligations concerning technology based on GRs
  - The role of IP rights and international IP protection
- IV. Transfer of technology to protect the environment
  - North-South dynamics in the negotiation of the UNFCCC and its technology transfer rules
  - From Rio to Paris and Beyond: the struggle over IP protection for ESTs

Sputnik, climate justice and lifestyle choices - assessing the reasons behind the IP debate

V. Conflict Clauses in international environmental agreements

The principles of State sovereignty over natural resources and of common but differentiated responsibilities for climate change

Specific conflict clauses

*Article 22:1 CBD*

*Article 4 NP*

General international law conflict resolution tools and alternative approaches

PART FIVE: INTEGRATION AND CONFLICT NORMS IN INTERNATIONAL IP LAW

Chapter 1: Conflict Rules and Specific Integration Tools in the International IP System

I. Formal conflict rules

II. Specific tools of accommodation – an overview

A ‘human rights treaty’ on mandatory exceptions and limitations in copyright

IP and public health: From Doha via Hong Kong to Kigali

Proposals for a disclosure of origin rule in TRIPS

III. Exceptions and limitations subject to the three step test

Chapter 2: General principles for integration

I. Public interest principles under Art.8 TRIPS

The origin: a general exception for public interest

In search for nature and function of Art.8:1

The concept of negative rights and non-violation complaints

The horizontal interpretative function of Art.8:1

II. The balancing objectives in Art.7 TRIPS

A mandate for tailoring IP protection towards domestic needs

Art.7 as treaty objective – implications for TRIPS interpretation

III. Art.7 and 8 TRIPS in WTO dispute settlement: 20 years of neglect

Application of Art.7 and 8 TRIPS

*US – Section 211 and EC – GIs*

*Canada – Patents*

Other cases referring to object and purpose

Possible explanations and the prospect of change in *Australia – Plain Packaging*

Chapter 3: The Protection of Intellectual Property in International Law: Fragmentation, Alternatives and the Limits of Integration

I. Resilience, cross-fertilisation and external concerns

II. Treaty interpretation, ceilings and a general exception clause