

PRICE MEDIA LAW MOOT COURT COMPETITION 2015-16 COMPILED CLARIFICATION QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS ALL (REGIONAL & INTERNATIONAL) ROUNDS

Umani's Chatter Accounts and Posts

- 1. Who deleted @TheVigilanteInsider's Post #3 on November 5, 2013? Umani.
- 2. Paragraph No. 17 states that the Government obtained a series of information about Umani and, at the end, states that media outlets were informed on May 31, 2014. However, it isn't clear what portion of said information (IP address, daughter's smartphone IP address, account, the sole fact that Umani was the user, etc) was actually disclosed to the media. Could you please clarify what information was provided to the media by the Government and by what means (press prelease, official/unofficial statement, source etc)? The Government informed media outlets that Umani was the user of the account @TheVigilanteInsider.
- **3.** As per para 17, did Omeria release the identity of Umani as the person behind @TheVigilanteInsider account to media outlets before he was charged? **Yes.**
- **4.** In paragraph 14, c. "re-chatted" is placed in quotation marks, while otherwise it was not. Is this "re-chatted" different from the others in the case? **No.**
- 5. After post #3 was deleted, could the re-chats still be seen by other users / Are all re-chatted versions of a post deleted when the original post is deleted? The re-chats could be seen by followers of those users even after the post was deleted by Umani.

6. Did Chatter reveal the IP addresses associated with all the posts, i.e. Posts #1-6, or did it reveal IP addresses only for Posts #4-6? The IP addresses revealed by Chatter were those associated with all of Umani's six posts.

Prosecution of Umani and Chatter

- 7. In paragraph 22 of the facts, it says that Umani and Chatter have challenged these "verdicts", then the issues have been framed about their "prosecution". Are "prosecution" and "verdict" referring to the same thing? Yes.
- 8. Does "prosecution" in the issue statements of the Case refer only to the substantial content or does it include procedural actions as well (e.g. the Government action that forced Chatter to reveal the identity of the person behind the account)? "Prosecution" refers specifically to the conviction of Umani and Chatter under the law.
- 9. In paragraph 22 of the Case, in Issues 1B and 2B, does "these same international principles" mean Articles 12 and 19 of the UDHR and Articles 17 and 19 of the ICCPR as mentioned in Issues 1A and 2A respectively? As with Issues 1A and 2A, the international principles include Article 12 and 19 of the UDHR and Articles 17 and 19 of the ICCPR.
- 10. In issues 1A-2B, the term 'international principles' is used alongside references to relevant UDHR and ICCPR Articles. Could you please define the term 'international principles' in this context? The issues may be considered under any relevant, applicable international principles, though teams are expected to address the specified Articles of the UDHR and ICCPR. Teams must bear in mind the jurisdiction of the Court and determine what weight should be given to the various legal principles that may be applicable.
- **11.** Issues 1A and 1B refer to Article 19 but not Article 20. As Tarlach McGonagle observed:

"It is rarely disputed that Articles 19 and 20, ICCPR, are

closely related. Indeed, during the drafting of the ICCPR, the draft article that ultimately became Article 20 was realigned so that it would immediately follow Article 19, thereby emphasising the contiguity of the two articles. Indeed, one leading commentator has even referred to Article 20 as being "practically a fourth paragraph to Article 19 and has to be read in close connection with the preceding article."

Does the absence of Article 20, but the reference to 'international principles' mean that drawing on Article 20 is within scope? **See Question #10 above**

12.What conventions or other international legal instruments or custom is meant by 'international principles'? **See Question #10 above.**

Omerian Law (General)

- **13.** Is Omeria a member of the United Nations and/or a signatory to the ICCPR? **See Question #14 below.**
- **14.** Has Omeria ratified the ICCPR and the UDHR? Yes.

CORRECTIONS TO CASE

It has come to our attention that the name 'Matan Umani' as used in the context of this year's Moot Court case, has raised concerns for some of our participants. While the moot court problem, and all names used in it, is entirely fictional, the Price Moot Court Administration does not wish to offend any of our stakeholders. Accordingly, the Moot Court problem has been amended to substitute all references to 'Matan Umani' with just 'Umani' as appropriate. Also, the last sentence of the Moot Court problem "[Include Appendix of Articles 12 and 19 of the UDHR and Articles 17 and 19 of the ICCPR.]" has been omitted.