



Collège universitaire, campus de Paris
Direction des études et de la scolarité
Semestre de printemps 2011

Syllabus

Nom de l'enseignant : Maybritt Jill ALPES

Titre de l'enseignement :

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE POLITICS OF EXPLOITATIVE LABOUR MIGRATION

Introduction:

The combat against 'human trafficking' attracts considerable funding and keeps policy-makers, UN officials, NGO workers and state employees busy. Preoccupations with the illegality of migration and prostitution dominate the perspective of international media and governmental campaigns. This course will unravel notions and anxieties surrounding sexuality, gender, illegality and immigration. So as to understand the phenomenon of human trafficking more fully, this course approaches exploitative labour migration from a human rights angle and will thus also discuss global dynamics of migration and development.

In this course, we will discuss human trafficking across different regions (predominantly West and East Africa, as well as South East Asia). The course will investigate the complexity of human trafficking as a form of exploitative labour migration both thematically (migrant domestic workers, child soldiers, sex workers, marriage migration, organ trafficking), as well as theoretically (sexuality, prostitution, migration and illegality). After having been equipped with a critical toolbox of social science concepts, students will be able to directly discuss programmes and policies designed to counter 'human trafficking'.

During the course, we will be addressing a series of questions in relation to the issue of human trafficking: What do we understand by human trafficking? What are the political and theoretical dilemmas that surround its legal definitions? What other forms of human trafficking do we know besides sex trafficking?

Objectives:

- To provide theoretical insights into the underlying dynamics of trafficking through conceptual tools and related issues such as gender, sexuality, legality, agency and vulnerability
- Introduction to real case scenarios from Asia and Africa, as well as discussion of cases of marriage migration, organ trafficking and labour brokerage
- To illuminate political dynamics of anti-trafficking campaigns and the very definition of the phenomenon of trafficking

Programme des séances:

Language of instruction: English

Teaching methods:

Group discussion of reading material; class exercises; film documentary; encounter with a practitioner

Overview of all twelve sessions :

1. What do we understand by human trafficking: from moral outrage to issues of mobility and human security (1st of Feb.)
2. Human trafficking, human smuggling and the Palermo Protocol (8th of Feb.)
3. Human trafficking and prostitution: slavery or sex work migration? (15th of Feb.)
4. Human trafficking and labour migration: bringing the state back in (22nd of Feb.)
5. Migration brokerage: Nigeria and Cameroon (8th of March)
6. From mail-order brides to marriage migration: Taiwan and the Philippines (15th of March)
7. Migrant domestic workers and multiple sources of vulnerability: Filipina women in Hong Kong and Europe (22nd of March)
8. The abduction of 'children' and the return of 'rebels'? Forced child soldiering in Uganda (29th of March)
9. Organ trafficking, the commodification of the body and development (5th of April)
10. Running from rescuers: UN Peace keeping forces and women in Bosnia and Kosovo (12th of April)
11. Prevention and reintegration: different approaches to 'combat' trafficking (19th of April)
12. Human trafficking and the politics of exploitative labour migration reconsidered (26th of April)

1. Introduction to human trafficking: from moral outrage to issues of mobility and human security (1st of Feb.)

General introduction to different approaches to the topic of human trafficking (i.e. morality, crime, public order, human rights, labour and migration): How is knowledge produced on human trafficking? What agendas are driving anti-trafficking programmes?

Class exercise: What would you like to learn about human trafficking? What do you understand by human trafficking? What do you think can be done about human trafficking?

Reading:

- Feingold, D., "Think Again: Human Trafficking", *Foreign Policy*, issue 150, September/October 2005, pp.26-32.
- Anderson, B., and Andrijasevic, R., "Sex, slaves and citizens: the politics of anti-trafficking", *Soundings*, issue 40, 2008, pp. 135- 145.

2. Human trafficking, smuggling and the Palermo Protocol (8th of Feb.)

What from a legal standpoint is supposed to be the difference between smuggling and trafficking? What political dynamics produced this distinction and in what ways is this distinction problematic and/or useful? How does trafficking relate to the politics of citizenship?

Reading:

- Ditmore, M., "Trafficking in Lives: How Ideology Shapes Policy", in Kempadoo, K, ed., *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*, (Paradigm Publishers, 2005), pp. 107- 126.
- Gallagher, A., "Trafficking, Smuggling and Human Rights: Tricks and Treaties", *Forced Migration Review*, 12, 2002, pp. 25- 28.

3. Human trafficking and prostitution: slavery or sex work migration? (15th of Feb.)

How do different schools of thought analyse the phenomenon of prostitution? How does trafficking relate to the politics of sex? Through which conceptual framework can the human rights of migrant women who work in prostitution best be understood and protected ?

Required Reading:

- Agustin, L., "The Disappearing of a Migration Category : Migrants who sell sex," *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32:1, 2006, pp. 29- 47.
- Doezema, J., "Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary v. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy", in Kempadoo, K., and Doezema, J., (eds.), *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*, (Routledge, 1998), pp. 34- 50.

Additional Reading:

- Julia O'Connell Davidson (2006) 'Will the real sex slave please stand up?', in *Feminist Review*, 83, (4-22), pp. 4-22. (18 p.)

4. Human Trafficking and labour migration: smuggling the state back in (22nd of Feb.)

How are immigration controls and trafficking related to one another? What makes migrant workers vulnerable to exploitation? What impact does state regulation of migration have on human trafficking? Who benefits from human trafficking? How does trafficking relate to the politics of labour?

Required Reading:

- Wong, D., "The Rumor of Trafficking: Border Controls, Illegal Migration, and the Sovereignty of the Nation-State", in van Schendel, W., Abraham, I., *Illit Flows and Criminal Things: States, borders, and the other side of globalisation*, (Indiana University Press, 2005), pp. 69- 101.
- Anderson, B., "Motherhood, apple pie and slavery: reflections on trafficking debates", *COMPAS working paper*, [WP-07-48](#), 2007, pp. 1- 20.

Additional Reading:

- Andrijasevic, R., "Migration and Sex Work in Europe, in *Migration, Agency and Citizenship in Sex Trafficking*, (Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), pp. 1- 25.

5. Migration brokerage: Nigeria and Cameroon (8th of March)

Why do traffickers do what they do? What motives drive migration brokers in their work? Is trafficking a just another business? Why do aspiring migrants trust migration brokers? How can we go beyond the dichotomy of 'victim' and 'perpetrator' in our analysis of exploitative labour migration?

Required Reading:

- Salt, J., and Stein, J., "Migration as a Business: The Case of Trafficking", *International Migration*, vol. 35, issue 4, 2002, pp. 467- 495.
- Spener, D., "Passing Judgment: Coyotes in the Discourse of Clandestine Border-Crossing", ch. 6, in *Clandestine Crossings: Migrants and Coyotes on The Texas-Mexico Border*, (Cornell University, 2009), pp. 201- 229.

Additional Reading:

- Carling, J., "Leaving Nigeria" in *Migration, Human Smuggling and Trafficking from Nigeria to Europe*, Prepared for IOM, (Geneva, 2006), pp. 21- 32.
- Spener, D., "Trust, Distrust, and Power: The Social Embeddedness of Coyote-Assisted Border-Crossings", ch. 5, in *Clandestine Crossings: Migrants and Coyotes on The Texas-Mexico Border*, (Cornell University, 2009), pp. 162- 200.

6. From mail-order brides to marriage migration: Taiwan and the Philippines (15th of March)

How can we best understand the agency of women engaged in cross-border marriages? How can we understand the role of money within marriage arrangements? What makes matchmaking a commercial activity?

Required Reading:

- Chia-Wen Lu, M., "Commercially Arranged Marriage Migration: Case Studies of Cross-border Marriages in Taiwan", *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 12:2&3, 2005, pp. 275-303.
- Constable, N., "Feminism and Myths of 'Mail-Order' Marriages", ch. 3 in *Romance on a Global Stage: Pen Pals, Virtual Ethnography, and 'Mail order' Marriages*, (University of California Press, 2003), pp. 63- 90.

Additional Reading:

- Johnson-Hanks, J., "Women on the market: Marriage, consumption and the internet in urban Cameroon", *American Ethnologist*, vol. 34, Nr. 4, 2007.

7. Migrant domestic workers and multiple source of vulnerability: Filipina women in Hong Kong and Europe (22nd of March)

What makes migrant domestic workers vulnerable? What determines the degree of control that women can have as domestic workers over the outcomes of their migration trajectories? How can migrant domestic workers be empowered?

Young and Invisible : African domestic workers in Yemen (2007):

We will see an excerpt from this documentary that exposes why Ehtioipian and Somalian women come to Yemen. The documentary discusses the living and working conditions of African domestic workers in Yemen.

Class exercise: participatory theatre as a tool to support migrant domestic workers

Reading:

- Anderson, B., "Just another Job? The commodification of deomestic labour" in in Ehrenreich, B., and Russell Hochschild, A., (eds.), *Global Woman-Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, (Granta Books, 2002), pp. 104-115.
- Constable, N., "Filipina Workers in Hong Kong Homes: Household Rules and Relations", in Ehrenreich, B., and Russell Hochschild, A., (eds.), *Global Woman-Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy*, (Granta Books, 2002), pp. 115- 141.

8. The abduction of 'children' and the return of 'rebels'? Forced child soldiering in Uganda? (29th of March)

Why have reintegration processes of formerly abducted children not been more successful? What are the long-term consequences for Ugandan society of the abduction of children? What are the challenges of dealing with young people that have in the past been forcefully recruited to fight for the Lord Resistance Army?

Readings:

- Akello, G., Richters, A., and Reis, R., "Reintegration of former child soldiers in northern Uganda: coming to terms with children's agency and accountability", *Intervention: Inter- national Journal of Mental Health, Psychosocial Work and Counselling in Areas of Armed Conflict*, 4(3), 2006, pp. 229-243.
- Blattman, C., and Annan, J., "Child combatants in northern Uganda: reintegration myths and realities", in Muggah, R., (ed.), *Security and Post-Conflict Reconstruction: Dealing with Fighters in the Aftermath of War*, (Routledge, 2008), pp. 103- 126.

9. Organ Trafficking, the commodification of the body and development (5th of April)

Although human organs for transplant may sometimes be procured by means of violence or its threat, there are also significant numbers of people who are driven by economic pressures to consent to sell organs. Is human trafficking a good analytical lens to analyze and deal with the trade in organs?

Readings:

- Scheperd-Hughes, N., "The Global Traffic in Human Organs", *Current Anthropology*, vol. 41, Number 2, April 2000.

Additional Reading:

- Budiani-Saberi, S. A., and Delmonico, F. L., "Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism: A Commentary on the Global Realities", *American Journal of Transplantation*, 8, 2008, pp. 925- 929.
- Whitehead, J., "The Harvest: Human Organs and Human Security", in *Human Security Journal*, Vol. 6, Spring 2008, pp.18-32 (14p.)

10. Running from rescuers: UN Peace keeping forces and women in Bosnia and Kosovo (12th of April)

In what ways are the UN, peace keepers and aid workers implicated in both trafficking and anti-trafficking? What are some of the pitfalls to avoid in trying to curb down on human rights violations and exploitative labour migration?

Screening of "The Peacekeepers and the Women" (Karin Jurschick, 2003, 80 min): "Winner of the Arte-Documentary Award for Best German Documentary, this chilling investigation examines the booming sex-trafficking industry in Bosnia and Kosovo, and boldly explores the disturbing role of the UN peacekeeping forces and the local military in perpetuating this tragic situation. In this documentary, Karin Jurschick confronts UN officials and aid workers, goes on a raid with international police, and reveals the tragic stories of the trafficked women themselves to provide insight into this complicated crime scene."

Required Reading:

- Limanowska, B., "Bosnia Herzegovina" in Dottridge, M., (ed.), *Collateral Damage: The Impact of Anti-Trafficking Measures on Human Rights around the World*, (GAATW, 2007), pp. 61- 86.
- Soderlund, G., "Running from the Rescuers: New U.S. Crusades Against Sex Trafficking and the Rhetoric of Abolition", *NWSA Journal*, vol. 17, No. 3, 2005, pp. 64- 87.

11. Preventing trafficking: migration, development and information (19th of April)

How does our view change if we look at 'trafficking' from the perspective of a society of origin? What could be good practices in the prevention of trafficking? Whose interests are served by what kind of anti-trafficking activities?

Required Reading:

- Nieuzenhuys, C., Pecoud, A., "Human trafficking, information campaigns, and strategies of migration control, *American Behavioral Scientist*, 50, 12, 2007, pp. 1674- 1695.
- Marshall, P., and Thatun, S., "Miles Away: The Trouble with Prevention in the Greater Mekong Sub-region," in Kempadoo, K, ed., *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*, (Paradigm Publishers, 2005), pp. 43- 64.

Additional Reading:

- Rutvica Andrijasevic (2007) "Beautiful Dead Bodies: gender, migration and representation in anti-trafficking campaigns", in *Feminist Review*, Vol.86, No.1, July, pp.24-44 (20p.)

12. Human Trafficking and the politics of exploitative labour migration reconsidered (26th of April)

Given the politics of sex, labour and citizenship, how to go about addressing the conditions in which trafficking and the exploitation of migrant labour are able to flourish?

Class exercise:

The results of the class exercise of the first session are handed out. The students are asked to reflect upon the questions that they had noted down in the first session. How has the way we look at trafficking and anti-trafficking campaigns evolved?

Reading :

- Chew, L, "Reflections by an Anti-trafficking Activist", in Kempadoo, K, ed., *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*, (Paradigm Publishers, 2005), p. 65- 80.
- LeVoy, M., and Verbruggen, N., "Ten Ways to Protect Undocumented Migrant Workers", PICUM, (Brussels, 2005).

Assessment:

1) Participation in class discussion:

- It is important that students learn to formulate their own views and opinions in relation to the literature of each session.

2) Class presentation :

- In teams of two (and exceptionally three), every student will prepare one class presentation. It is much better if the class presentation is the outcome of actual team work.
- *Together* a presentation will last a maximum of 10 minutes. I will be timing your presentations and cut you off when you have gone beyond the 10 minutes. Strict time-keeping is a very difficult exercise, but it will help you greatly in your future professional lives.
- The format of the presentation does not have to follow the classical Sciences Po style. You are free to choose a structure for the presentation that allows you to introduce the theme of the session in a *coherent, comprehensible and engaging* manner.
- An ideal presentation discusses the theoretical and practical *implications* of the readings of the week and relates these implications to real life cases.
- As part of your class presentation, you are also required to also *animate the class discussion*. Again, please prepare and discuss these questions together with your colleagues. Explore together in your team whether or not a question is capable of leading your class mates to think critically about the theme of the session. As a tip : think of three sub-questions for your main question that you

can give to your fellow colleagues when the main question at first does not launch a debate.

3) Two short literature assignments:

- The students are free to choose for which session they want to hand in their respective literature assignments.
- The literature assignment has to be sent in electronically *before* the respective session by *monday 9.00 am* at the very latest.
- A literature assignment is never (!) longer than 1 ½ pages (1 ½ space)
- A literature assignment discusses and compares *both* pieces of reading assigned as compulsory for the respective session.
- A literature assignment covers these three points :
 - o *Argument* : What are the arguments of the two pieces of reading ?
 - o *Quote* : Choose a quote which you think best reflects this argument and present your motivation for choosing this quote
 - o *Critique* : Present an analytical critique of the concept, argument or assumptions behind this quote (Is it useful ? Are there problems with this perspective ?)

Class discussion and class presentation together make up 50% of the final mark. The two literature assignments count for another 50% of your final mark.

Additional reading:

- Sanghera, J., "Unpacking the Trafficking Discourse", in Kempadoo, K, ed., *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*, (Paradigm Publishers, 2005), pp. 3- 24.
- Zheng, T., (ed.), *Sex Trafficking, Human Rights, and Social Justice*, (Routledge, 2010).

Relevant web-addresses:

<http://www.antislavery.org/english/default.aspx>
<http://www.unescobkk.org/culture/our-projects/protection-of-endangered-and-minority-cultures/trafficking-and-hiv-aids-project/>
<http://childtrafficking.org/eng/>
<http://www.catwinternational.org/>
<http://www.december18.net/web/general/start.php?lang=EN>
<http://www.humantrafficking.org/>
<http://www.iom.int/jahia/jsp/index.jsp>
http://www.nodo50.org/Laura_Agustin
www.picum.org

Film Recommendations:

"It's a free world" (2007):

Unaware of the full dynamics of the field within which she was operating, Rose started working as an employee for a recruitment firm. When fired, Rose decides to become self-employed. She starts her own recruitment agency within the informal sector and for a long time remains hesitant to also place workers without papers. Yet, one step

leads to another. Is Rose a migration broker helping people to find work or a trafficker?

Surprising Europe (2009):

Ssuuna Golooba was a succesful photo journalist in Uganda, but in Europe he has to clean toilets to earn a living. He decides to make a film over his life in Europe before returning to Uganda.

Lilja 4-ever (2002) :

Lilja is 16 years old. Her only friend is the young boy Volodja. They live in Estonia, fantasizing about a better life. One day, Lilja falls in love with Andrej. He is going to Sweden, and invites Lilja to come along and start a new life.